

Summary of Supplemental Educational Services (SES) Provider Effects on Student Achievement in Chicago Public Schools[†]

The table below presents information on the effectiveness of providers of supplemental educational services (SES) in improving the reading and math achievement of Chicago Public Schools students. These estimates of provider effectiveness are generated using measures of student achievement gains based on students' reading and math test scores on the Illinois Standard Achievement Test (ISAT). An econometric approach to estimation of these effects known as *value-added modeling with school fixed effects* is applied to adjust for student and school characteristics that may differ across SES providers.

In the table, we report whether a given SES provider had a statistically significant positive effect on students' reading and/or math achievement in the 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11 and/or 2011-12 school years. We report that a SES provider had a "high impact" if it had an impact larger than the average impact on student learning for all providers. If no impacts are noted, this implies the results were inconclusive, that is, the range of student test-score improvements spanned both positive and negative numbers or the improvements were zero or negative.

Importantly, we did not estimate impacts individually for SES providers that served fewer than 30 students in a given year, as there are statistical limitations to producing accurate estimates for small numbers of students. Thus, we estimated overall "small provider" impacts for all of the small providers together; these results and the providers included in this analysis are shown at the end of the table.

In addition, in the 2011-12 school year, many providers continued to tutor students after the March 2012 ISAT testing dates. In the final column of the table, we report what percent of the total tutoring hours were provided to students before testing took place. The estimated effects for providers will only reflect the hours of tutoring that took place before the March testing dates, and therefore, for many of these providers, the effects may be underestimated (smaller than the true effects).

For all providers, we also report the average number of hours of SES received by students attending their programs in each school year. **The analysis finds that students who receive more hours of tutoring from SES providers have larger test score gains.**

In the table below:

- Providers with statistically significant positive impacts on student achievement (as measured by improvements in test scores) are highlighted in gray.
- Statistically significant student test-score improvements that are above the average impact are identified as "high impacts" in the third column of the table.

[†]Results of a Multisite Study of the Implementation and Effects of Supplemental Educational Services, funded by the Institute of Education Sciences, PR/Award number: R305A090301Study website: <http://sesiq2.wceruw.org/papers.html>.

**Chicago Public Schools Supplemental Educational Services (SES)
 Provider Impacts on Student Achievement,
 Hours of SES Provided, and Hourly Rates:
 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12 School Years**

| Provider name | Positive impacts on student achievement | High impact (greater than average) | Average hours of SES received by students | | | | % of tutoring received by 2012 ISAT test date |
|---|--|--|---|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------|---|
| | | | 2008-09 | 2009-10 | 2010-11 | 2011-12 | |
| 1 to 1 Tutor aka Tutor Owl | | | | | | 26.5 | 41.8 |
| 1-on-1 Learning with Laptops | | | | | | 22.2 | 21.6 |
| A+ Tutoring Service, LTD (<i>small provider in 2011-12</i>) | reading (2008-09) | reading (2008-09) | 46.1 | 32.6 | 43.1 | 42.0 | 66.1 |
| Academic Advantage | reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) | reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) | | | 42.7 | 35.3 | 77.4 |
| Ahead of Class Services | | | | | 24.2 | | |
| A.I.M. High | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | 51.0 | 45.8 | 53.6 | 50.6 | 60.3 |
| ASPIRA | | | 31.8 | 19.6 | | | |
| Babbage Net School | math (2008-09) | math (2008-09) | 39.5 on-site | 47.1/ 25.4 (on-line) | 17.6/ 30.6 (on-site) | 24.6 | 58.3 |
| Black Star Project (<i>small provider in 2011-12</i>) | | | 38.5 | 35.2 | 34.5 | 34.4 | 80.8 |
| Brain Hurricane | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | reading (2008-09) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | 32.4 | 35.1 | 36.6 | 34.8 | 59.6 |

| Provider name | Positive impacts on student achievement | High impact (greater than average) | Average hours of SES received by students | | | | % of tutoring received by 2012 ISAT test date |
|---|--|--|---|----------------------------|---------|---------|---|
| | | | 2008-09 | 2009-10 | 2010-11 | 2011-12 | |
| Brainfuse <i>(small provider in 2011-12)</i> | reading (2010-11) | reading (2010-11) | 22.7/ 24.4 (on-line) | 27.5/ 24.8 (on-line) | 22.0 | 21.0 | 84.2 |
| Breakthrough Urban Ministries | | | | | 40.5 | | |
| Brilliance Academy | | | 24.7 | 31.3 | 41.2 | | |
| Cambridge Educational Services | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2010-11) | reading (2008-09) math (2008-09) math (2010-11) | 27.0 | 24.4 | 31.2 | 25.2 | 87.1 |
| Center of Higher Development | | | | | 43.3 | | |
| Chess Academy | math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | 48.4 | 43.5 | 47.8 | 42.4 | 60.2 |
| Chicago Ace it Tutoring | | | | | 24.4 | | |
| Children's Home + Aid Society, Inc. | math (2008-09) math (2009-10) | math (2008-09) math (2009-10) | 36.8 | 31.7 | 37.7 | | |
| ClubZ! Tutoring Service, Inc. | math (2010-11) | math (2010-11) | 32.9 | 33.6 | 50.8 | | |
| CSC Julex Learning | | | 50.3 | | | | |
| Educate Online (formerly Catapult) | reading (2009-10) math (2011-12) | reading (2009-10) | 18.6 | 23.1 | | 32.5 | 43.4 |
| Education Masters | math (2011-12) | | | | | 29.3 | 58.2 |
| Educational Specialties | | | | 47.9 | | | |
| Failure Free Reading | | | 27.0/ 31.9 (on-site) | | | | |
| GradeCracker LLC | | | | | | 29.7 | 18.6 |
| Huntington | reading (2008-09) reading (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | reading (2008-09) reading (2010-11) reading (2011-12) | 31.7 | 36.2 | 33.6 | 35.3 | 65.4 |
| IEP | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) | reading (2008-09) | 46.3 | 46.4 | 44.9 | 44.8 | 75.4 |

| Provider name | Positive impacts on student achievement | High impact (greater than average) | Average hours of SES received by students | | | | % of tutoring received by 2012 ISAT test date |
|--|--|--|---|---------|---------|---------|---|
| | | | 2008-09 | 2009-10 | 2010-11 | 2011-12 | |
| Imagine Learning | reading (2011-12) | reading (2011-12) | | | 28.0 | 32.9 | 82.2 |
| Learn it System | reading (2010-11) | reading (2010-11) | | | 44.3 | 31.8 | 44.0 |
| Literacy for All | reading (2009-10) math (2009-10) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | math (2009-10) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | 42.9 | 46.1 | 47.7 | 41.4 | 60.4 |
| Mainstream Development Educational Group | | | 36.6 | 21.7 | 30 | 25.1 | 70.2 |
| NESI (<i>small provider in 2009-10</i>) | math (2008-09) math (2010-11) | math (2010-11) | 47.9 | 45.1 | 48.6 | 40.3 | 50.4 |
| Newton Learning | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) math (2011-12) | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2010-11) math (2011-12) | 45.0 | 38.9 | 44.8 | 38.7 | 61.4 |
| One-to-One Learning Center | reading (2008-09) math (2008-09) | reading (2008-09) math (2008-09) | | | 54.6 | | |
| Orion's Mind | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | math (2008-09) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) | 33.6 | 38.5 | 40.7 | 34.6 | 63.9 |
| Platform Learning | | | 28.5 | | | | |
| Podar Ser (<i>small provider in 2011-12</i>) | reading (2008-09) | reading (2008-09) | 36.0 | 39.0 | 49.2 | 43.4 | 70.5 |
| Princeton Review | reading (2008-09) math (2008-09) | math (2008-09) | 42.9 | | | | |
| Progressive Learning | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2009-10) | reading (2008-09) | 29.2 | 29.3 | 30.7 | 29.3 | 70.8 |
| Rocket Learning Partners, LLC | reading (2009-10) | | 30.3 | 31.0 | 30.7 | 24.8 | 50.9 |

| Provider name | Positive impacts on student achievement | High impact (greater than average) | Average hours of SES received by students | | | | % of tutoring received by 2012 ISAT test date |
|--|---|---|---|---------|---------|---------|---|
| | | | 2008-09 | 2009-10 | 2010-11 | 2011-12 | |
| SES of Illinois | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) math (2011-12) | reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) math (2011-12) | 34.4 | 30.5 | 35.0 | 33.1 | 64.5 |
| SPC Educational Solutions | | | | | 50.3 | 40.2 | 74.2 |
| School Service Systems | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2009-10) reading (2011-12) | 57.4 | 54.7 | 57.9 | 52.1 | 73.4 |
| Smart Kids, Inc. (combined with small providers 2009-10, 2010-11) | reading (2011-12) | reading (2011-12) | 53.9 | 54.9 | 52 | 45.1 | 66.0 |
| Spanish Learning Center, Inc. | reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) | reading (2010-11) math (2010-11) | | | 53.5 | 46.7 | 64.0 |
| Sylvan Learning Center, Inc. | reading (2010-11) | reading (2010-11) | | | 32.1 | 28.0 | 67.4 |
| Tutorial Services | | | 36.4 | 51.3 | | 46.6 | 45.1 |
| The Homework Master Center/ Train Up a Child (combined with small providers in 2011-12) | reading (2010-11) | reading (2010-11) | 40.8 | 42.4 | 35.0 | 35.9 | 48.4 |
| Unparalleled Solutions | reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | math (2010-11) reading (2011-12) math (2011-12) | | 44.8 | 59.2 | 54.4 | 67.9 |
| Small SES Providers | reading (2009-10) math (2011-12) | reading (2009-10) math (2011-12) | | | | | |

Impacts of small SES providers on student achievement (those with fewer than 30 students that have information available for estimating provider effects) are not shown separately in this report. In each school year, these smaller providers are combined into a single group to estimate their average effects on student achievement. Impacts for small providers combined are listed above and small provider names and average hours tutored for each are listed below.

| Provider name | Positive impacts on student achievement | High impact (greater than average) | Average hours of SES received by students | | | | % of tutoring received by 2012 ISAT test date |
|--|---|------------------------------------|---|---------|---------|---------|---|
| | | | 2008-09 | 2009-10 | 2010-11 | 2011-12 | |
| 100 Scholars | <i>No estimates of SES provider effects on student achievement are available for small providers who serve fewer than 30 students. The combined effects of all small providers are shown above.</i> | | | | | 36.3 | 3.0 |
| 3 to 1 Learning | | | | | | 53.3 | 80.3 |
| A+ Education Centers | | 47.8 | 52.3 | | | | |
| A Better Grade | | | | | | 35.5 | 71.1 |
| Academic Advantage | | | 12.6 | 42.7 | | | |
| Academic Solutions, Inc. | | | 13.0 | | | | |
| Achieve High Points | | | | | | | |
| African American Images | | 34.0 | | 50 | 14.5 | | 98.8 |
| Ahead of the Class Services (formerly Spectra) | | | 18.6 | 24.25 | | | |
| All Children Can Learn | | | | 36.8 | 48.6 | | 45.8 |
| Alternatives Unlimited | | | | | 35.1 | | 15.3 |
| Association House of Chicago | | | 46.2 | | | | |
| ATS Project Success | | 27.6 | 27.2 | | 28.9 | | 53.2 |
| Black Star Project | | | | 34.5 | 34.4 | | 80.8 |
| BSG Training & Consulting, Inc. | | 37.2 | | | | | |
| Breakthrough Urban Ministries | | 63.1 | 60.9 | 40.5 | | | |
| C&T After School Programs | | 18.0 | | | | | |
| Carter, Reddy & Associates, Inc. | | 25.5 | 14.7 | 35.5 | 25.6 | | 40.3 |
| Center of Higher Development | | 21.0 | | 43.3 | | | |
| Chi Tutorz | | | | | 20.8 | | 16.4 |
| Chicago Ace it Tutoring | | | 24.4 | | | | |
| College Nannies + Tutors | | | 30.2 | 34.4 | | 85.5 | |

| Provider name | Positive impacts on student achievement | High impact (greater than average) | Average hours of SES received by students | | | | % of tutoring received by 2012 ISAT test date | |
|---|---|------------------------------------|---|----------------------|----------------------|---------|---|------|
| | | | 2008-09 | 2009-10 | 2010-11 | 2011-12 | | |
| Comp Ed II | <i>No estimates of SES provider effects on student achievement are available for small providers who serve fewer than 30 students. The combined effects of all small providers are shown above.</i> | | | | 52.5 | 51.7 | 62.9 | |
| Cool Kids Learn, Inc. | | | | | | 26.3 | 100 | |
| D.K.Y. Developers | | | | | | 56.2 | 94.0 | |
| Empowerment Learning | | | | | | 27.2 | 61.2 | |
| Growing Scholars Educational Center | | | | 47.1 | 17.1 | | 97.1 | |
| Grade Results | | | | 11.9 | | | | |
| Holy Family Ministries | | | | | | 59.7 | 41.9 | |
| Hope Haven Christian Academy | | | 44.1 | | | | | |
| Innovadia | | | | | | 31.3 | 8.4 | |
| Jeremi Learning | | | | | | 29.8 | 100 | |
| KnowledgePoints Learning Center | | | | 33.5 (on-site) /51.1 | 38.3 (on-site) /52.5 | | | |
| Mainstream Development Educational Group | | | | | 30 | | | |
| Poder Ser | | | | | 49.2 | | | |
| Reach for Tomorrow | | | | 23.8 | 25.2 | | | |
| Scholars for the 21 st Century | | | | | | 58.2 | 26.1 | 23.8 |
| Spanish Learning Center, Inc. | | | | 52.2 | 52.8 | | | |
| Superior Chicago Tutoring | | | | | | | 55.8 | 81.2 |
| The Homework Master Center/Train Up a Child | | | | 40.8 | 42.4 | 35.0 | 35.9 | 48.5 |